

# CS199 (Spring 2018): Thinking Critically About Data Final Project

Date handed out: May 17, 2018

## Description:

Your task is to find two (or more) articles on the same topic that report on findings based in the same study or dataset but that summarize the original work in different ways. You should research the data and papers cited in the article to develop a fuller understanding of the claim being made and any alternative explanations that should be considered. You should analyze the interpretations provided in each piece in the context of the pitfalls discussed in class, discuss the strengths and weaknesses of each, and summarize your own final interpretation of the issue at hand.

## Deliverables:

- Peer review (June 5, 2018): Exchange rough drafts among groups and receive written peer review.
- Paper (due June 7, 2018): Paper should include:
  - Introduction to the pieces.
    - What is the original study/dataset about?
    - What is the initial (potentially misleading) impression of each article?
  - In-depth explanation of aspects of the pieces that could mislead
    - How could dropped information along the ‘telephone’ game mislead readers/viewers?
    - What are the strengths and weaknesses of each article’s summary of the data/study?
  - Suggestions for clarifying the articles
- Presentation (June 7, 2018):
  - ~10-15 minute presentation
- Team member contributions:
  - Each team member will turn in a short description of team roles.

Projects will be evaluated on:

- (20%) Appropriateness of case study. Is the piece controversial? Misleading? Relevant to class?
- (25%) Quality of argument about what is problematic about the case study.
  - Correct application of ideas from class.
  - May involve finding the original data or simulating data.
- (20%) Quality of suggestions for alternative presentations.
  - Would the suggestions resolve the issue? Present any new issues of their own?
- (10%) Clarity of paper.
- (10%) Clarity of presentation.
- (10%) Peer review.
- (5%) Team member contributions.